



STATE OF NEW YORK  
DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE AND MARKETS  
10B AIRLINE DRIVE  
ALBANY, NEW YORK 12235

**Division of Plant Industry**

Phone: (518) 457-2087

Fax: (518) 457-1204

Transcription of Individuals Comments Regarding Regulatory Actions  
to Reduce Human Spread of Emerald Ash Borer,  
Emerald Ash Borer Stakeholder Meeting  
August 4, 2010

Jim Walters (Catskill Forest Association):  
I'm anti-regulations. I say none.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):  
Just let it run its course

Jim Waters (Catskill Forest Association):  
Let it run its course.

1:38:14

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):  
Can I make one comment about that?

Jim Waters (Catskill Forest Association):  
Yup.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):  
If the state doesn't put any regulation in place, the federal government will regulate the entire state. So that's the flip side.

Jim Waters (Catskill Forest Association):  
That's the flip side.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):  
Just so you know.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):  
Steve.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):  
Makes it easier for us though.

Steve Servies (Gutchess Lumber):

From an observation, I'm looking at the state map that was handed out, it, if my geography is correct, it looks like the positive counties the quarantine counties and the suspect counties all have major transportation corridors running through them, I86, 390, I87. I'm a little surprised that there have not been any finds on I81 with all the firewood that I see coming out of Pennsylvania going north but in any event, I guess I'd like to make the point that from a commerce standpoint, from a Gutchess Lumber standpoint the quarantine would be better for us in that if along the major corridors there could be some movement and we don't have counties that are nonquarantined like Alleghany. If we could try to group these counties so that we could have some movement of product in quarantine during the fly time, I think that would be most helpful for us.

?:

So you are in favor of including or not including Alleghany?

Steve Servies (Gutchess Lumber):

Including.

?:

In including.

Steve Servies (Gutchess Lumber):

The other problem, just real quickly, for us is that, and I think Tom had the same issue, is you're buying timber all over the state you're buying mixed stands of timer, hard maple, ash tree, red oak and we knew this issue was coming so we're trying to be a little selective in what we're doing. However, you can buy timber and you can be harvesting during the summer months and the ash is scattered throughout the stand so logistically can you go back and really harvest that lumber during the summer time. Some of these stands are summertime only stands, you have to think about some permits and things like that to work with in the summer time. Tarping, I'm not sure that's really realistic. So.

?

\_\_\_\_\_ on the lumber trucks.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

Well, I think, I think the other issue I think what you're confusing is if you, if you if we choose not to include Allegany county and you want to get from Cattaraugus county to Steuben county during flight season you're coming out of a regulated area, you have no option. So in terms of tarping, it's only if you're coming from a nonregulated through a regulated area. In this case when you want to go from Cattaraugus to Steuben during flight season you're not going to be able to go because Allegany is sitting right in the middle or your way down down 86. So in terms of what would help you, Allegany...

?:

If we were going from, If I understood it right and maybe I've got it backwards, if we were going from say Steuben now that that's a quarantine county we're discussing...

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

Right.

?:

...through Allegany to Cattaraugus...

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

You're still in the same scenario. You can't transport through Allegany cause its during flight season, it's a nonquarantine area. You're taking a regulated article out of an infested area and moving it to a nonquarantine area.

?:

I thought that if it was tarped and you're passing through...

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

That's coming from a nonquarantine area through a quarantine area in route to a nonquarantine area. The issue there is we assume that everything from the quarantine area is infested and therefore cannot move during flight season. The only time you'd be able to move a regulated article out of a quarantine area is during nonflight season. So in your case, you'd want Allegany so you could move all season long through there without any restriction.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Steve, just for the, to help us out as well, we've got to do the economic impact, how many employees at Gutchess Lumber. How many people are affected by this.

Steve Servies (Gutchess Lumber):

Approximately 300.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Ron.

Ron Vandergroef (Rawlings Adirondack):

I'm probably well similar to him, kind of an extremist in one regard is either as small as possible or as big as possible. Because, you know, looking at this, we've I've got another little map here which has all our suppliers on it circling all the counties and about 75% of them are circled are, you know, the ones we get our logs from and Allegany, Steuben all those are circled. Greene is circled, Ulster is not so I guess that it's either, to me, you know, the further we go for us from the business aspect, the worse it's gonna affect business unless you include us too. Because of what you, as you creep in, we get, you know, our suppliers become smaller and smaller for availability. So I think from that perspective we'd like to have it one or the other. It's kind of the best issue for us.

The other thing I was thinking, kind of writing some notes down, it seems as though the, and maybe this has been said and I missed it, but it seems like the concentration of the traps seem to be going towards the area of, and correct me if I'm wrong on this, they seem to be going towards the area where it's been detected because I know a couple years ago one of our mills located in Dolgeville we also had traps up there.

?:

\_\_\_\_\_the purple traps.

Ron Vandergroef (Rawlings Adirondack):

I know they were starting, that was the time they were starting. And they've since stopped trapping up there and I don't know if that's been a common thing or...

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

That was one of our CAPS traps. I don't think that was part of an actual survey. It was an inspector that, part, there's a lot of different trapping regimes that are going on and the one that you had there in Dolgeville was handled as part of our CAPS program. We've since because of the extensive nature of what USDA is doing with DEC we've since dropped those traps off and they're picking up now in terms of having the traps there or not. It might be a high risk area that you could suggest to Yvonne to have a trap there if you're interested.

1:44:32

Ron Vandergroef (Rawlings Adirondack):

I was gonna say what, you know, I would assume we would probably be a high risk area being \_\_\_\_\_.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

We did some visual survey around there too.

Ron Vandergroef (Rawlings Adirondack):

Yeah and that was the other thing that I kind of had note on is, you know, we were talking about different best methods of detection stuff and I know, you know, he's in the business a little bit more and actually talk to the people and he's gotten people saying yeah our whole stand of ash is dead \_\_\_ in Fulton county don't know if it's real or not but how do we, how do we do that and you kind of chasing your tail to some degree by going by rumors but when you have those kind of finds, how do we, from the business aspect, you know, we're gonna get probably hundreds of people coming in, we're gonna hear this or that. How do we kind of focus that towards maybe we need to look at that or get some better methods of detection.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

We can give you some lists. There's an 800 number you can call in and report a find. We do a prescreen and then if there's something to it, somebody will go out, DEC, ourselves, somebody will go out and check.

===

Rob Johnson (Rawlings Adirondack):

One supplier told me about finding it, his whole stand is, that are dying. He said

?:

If its more than an acres.

?:

No its probably 100 acres.

Jerry Carlson:

Again, we've already been to Cattaraugus, to Catskill. You know, it's really hard to find this thing when it's small. And that's one point I want, I make this point, is that the infestation down there in Ruby, it looks big this year, last year it was probably 1/30<sup>th</sup> or at least 1/30<sup>th</sup> the size and probably close to 1/100<sup>th</sup> of what it is this year. That's how fast this thing spreads. The other thing to remember is the distribution of ash. You know, the distribution of ash is gonna affect how quickly this thing moves around as well as the movement \_\_\_\_.

Ron Vandergroef (Rawlings Adirondack):

And one last comment is you know when you're doing this in terms of detection and movement stuff I guess my concern is of that you know we are quarantining now and we're gonna find out a year or two later that well it was already there. So from my perspective that's...

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

We'll have this conversation again next week.

Ron Vandergroef (Rawlings Adirondack):

I know we will.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

But you're, again for the record, you're using mostly white ash as a species...

Ron Vandergroef (Rawlings Adirondack):

Probably 90%.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Right. 90% for baseball bats that you're making up there and how many families.

Ron Vandergroef (Rawlings Adirondack):

About 50.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

50.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

And your source is predominantly Adirondacks or...

Ron Vandergroef (Rawlings Adirondack):

Most of the state actually. We've got Essex county, Clinton, we don't get anything out of there. Warren, Washington, whatever in that center hole, I mean you can basically take state and straight across the whole middle, that's most of our suppliers. We do get some out of Pennsylvania but the heart of it is right across that center.

----

1:47:15

Rob Johnson (Rawlings Adirondack):

One of the things, you know, if you quarantine it if its in a small section its gonna be hard for us because you know we buy it from different log suppliers. Log yards where -----they buy it from small owners. So it's gonna be hard to regulate ok he bought it from this guy, he bought it from this guy. It's gonna be very hard to regulate it.

Rob Johnson (Rawlings Adirondack):

----Because if you have one supplier buying I don't know how many hundred thousand logs in a buy, are they gonna be mixing improperly you know if they bought some from quarantine and some from nonquarantine, how are they gonna say that ok the right logs, you know, they didn't get flip flopped and all that.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

They do have to segregate. As those that have already been involved know that's not an easy issue but that's how it goes.

Rob Johnson (Rawlings Adirondack):

On the logging side, it's a little bit more controlled and I think the opening comments were, you know, there's certainly a premise that firewood for personal use, campgrounds etc is a significant opportunity to spread at a faster pace so maybe we might consider a suggest more stringent when it comes to firewood movement. When you start bundling 3 or 4 counties together it might make since for the industry side of logging but you know, that private firewood guy is a little more of a wild wild west type of an attitude. I've got a brother-in-law or friend down in lower Ulster county and Im gonna supply the guy with a summer home up in the top of Greene, it starts, that a big transport and when we have a, I see a list \_\_\_ of pretty small concentration. I can see it easily coming to the Green Ulster counties via the firewood avenue. I don't know if there's something tighter when it comes to the movement of that firewood where is has a certain, a smaller zone for movement of firewood.

Yvonne DeMarino:

You mean an adjusted quarantine that, if that's what you're suggesting, that's not gonna happen. I mean the regulated articles are going to be the regulated articles for quarantine. There's gonna be one quarantine. Try to have one quarantine for one thing and another quarantine for another is, I've never heard of that ever occurring.

Rob Johnson (Rawlings Adirondack):

you've already said 25 miles instead of 50 miles.

Rob Johnson (Rawlings Adirondack):

But the firewood, if I understood right, in a quarantine area, that 50 miles no longer applies.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

No, no, no it still applies.

Rob Johnson (Rawlings Adirondack):

I misunderstood.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

And I had that notation on that. The DEC, the federal/state quarantine does not supersede the DEC regulation for firewood. So what you will have is as the quarantine expands out, you will still have restricted movement under DEC's title 13 in their firewood provision. So as our quarantine on Emerald Ash Borer expands out, those regulations still in play but that really on the firewood perspective only affects the folks on the on the outer edge. Back within the quarantine area, those folks that are within the quarantine area are then probably only affected by the DEC rule. Because as your quarantine gets bigger, you still have the DEC firewood that's containing it within that 50 mile radius and Bruce can talk about his firewood reg more than I can but in terms of a quarantine, you're confined within that quarantine unless you treat it but you also have to meet, I'm gonna call it Bruce's firewood reg.

Doug Brown (Campground Owners Association of NY):

And the campgrounds owners are very proactive. We want them to really be on top of this. Here comes the guest, they have the firewood, there's no tag, no labeling in accordance with the regulation, who do we call. Do they get a fine? What's the punishment? Is the questions that the association always gets is how to put a little bit of bite in the regulation.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

And there's a couple aspects that affect that. Is it outside of a quarantine area and was it treated. Is it moved further than 50 miles? Those three questions will affect who gets involved and how it's handled and unfortunately that's not always known to you. Sometimes you've just got, you know, we'd have to come up with some sort of way for you to start somewhere and we could investigate. If it's not us, pass it off or if it's not DEC, they pass, you know that type of thing.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Let me just ask that as we go around, we're getting tight on time again, but as we go around, just say your name and who you're with so that I make sure that as we transcribe these notes we can attribute the comments. Jim, I know wants the entire state.

Jim Waters (Catskill Forest Owners):

No.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Oh, you don't want anything. I'm sorry. Well, we'll say it exactly the way its recorded, in your words, but go ahead.

Don Bennett (Campground Owners of New York):

With the tight budgets and the enforcement difficulties, I guess we'll call it that, I think for us, you know, if we can keep hammering the education piece of it, I think that's gonna be the best thing we can do. You know, again if we can get some guidance with what we do with it when they bring it to the parks, how to handle that part of it, who to call. Because the origin, you're never going to get people to tell the truth, "oh I bought it from the guy with the stand down the street." Ok I guess that's within fifty miles but unless there's documentation, there's a lot of firewood people that, you know, they don't follow the regs. So, to me I think for us in the campground industries it's just continue the education.

Lori Mithen DeMasi (New York Association of Towns):

It seems I am the only local government person here today. As I see it, we are sort of touched by these regulations in all kinds of ways. The possibly we may be part of the regulated community. We also have several campgrounds. And then there's the cost factor with respect to tree removal along our highways and in our parks. So, you know, it's difficult to say what I would suggest at this point in terms of possible regulatory changes. We look at regulations from all types of viewpoints. One of them is can we afford to comply. Another one is if we try if we broaden the regulation so that it's gonna save us money in terms of having costs for tree removals that could save us money, it could be a wash. I can't really offer you unfortunately today any commentary in respect to what to do in terms of future regulations.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Well we're glad you came and were part of the conversation. Now, you know, this was, and you could probably help us by sharing some of that information back with the town, the extent of what's going on and we know there's fiscal costs to the towns as they deal with this as

communities struck. You know, we've been through the chestnut and the elm and what's our street trees left, we've got ash. So as a street tree, it's a very important. As Dave\_\_\_ said probably ash sales from our nursery and landscape folks, you've probably seen a major decline in that area but the towns, this is gonna be a big issue for the communities to deal with, we know that.

1:54:39

Lori Mithen DeMasi (New York Association of Towns):  
Do you know what your timeframe is.

Kevin King (NSYDAM).

Jacque is telling me quicker, quicker, quicker. I think they wanted it last week but. You know, we are still trying to figure out the delineation. As Paul suggested, there is probably two more weeks of where we think there will be movement of the bug, just from the seasonality prospective and you know I think what we are starting to narrow down, you know, based on what we know right now, we are starting to develop and be able to put those regs in place. As Dave knows, we've started to, started to issue stop sales orders in some nurseries near the infested area already. So we're responding but but the regs themselves will have to take, we will have to go through, this will be emergency rule making. We hope to do this in the next several weeks.

Rob Davies (NYS DEC):  
That's on the state side.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):  
That's on the state

Rob Davies (NYS DEC)  
The Federal will be longer.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):  
Dave

Dave Linehan (New York State Nursery Landscape Association):

I can't speak for everything but I guess the more the merrier. It's just the two counties. I don't know the highest concentrations of ash, you know, what counties has them. We have to look for that too. Education I think is the big thing. The state's done a great job with the Emerald Ash Borer and what they've done so far. They need to continue that. My question was, the reason I raised my hand is I'm interested in a local issue too. To have a question for Ethan. You know, there are treatments for high value trees.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):  
Yes.

Dave Linehan (New York State Nursery Landscape Association):  
And I would think there would be some treatments for..

?

Triage

Dave Linehan (New York State Nursery Landscape Association):

Large scale trees which we move so ... that's not the.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

No because it's not, part of the treatment is that the treatment has to be ongoing and USDA does not, to them there's not, there's not a mitigation of the risk of EAB to treatment. So if you had ash nursery stock in your nursery and you wanted it treated, I assume triage is what you're looking at...

?

—

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

Yes. To treat it, that's not an acceptable treatment method under USDA because that treatment has to be ongoing and has to continue and still not I mean I don't have the research but I mean, is it 100%, no its not. Therefore it's not, there's no allowed movement of it. You know, that's the problem for nursery stock. There's no treatment allowed and there's no treatment available that would provide 100% treatment. Whereas in the logging industry they can do things and most of them do and when they square up their lumber, you know, you're only talking on the outside. It's not like Asian Longhorned Beetle where it's in the middle of this. This is on the outside. So they can get rid of that, burn that, chip it, you know, do a lot of things where they mitigate the risk 100%.

?

I think that \_\_\_\_\_its probably not tested.

Dave Linehan (New York State Nursery Landscape Association):

Yeah, it's USDA that's controlling that aspect of it. My other question is, im very interested in the localities are doing with combating this and could you tell me a little bit more what Rochester is doing? Is it \$150,000 to take down ash tree and for what purpose.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

All I can tell you Dave is the press released the press report that we saw that they just recently approved a budget modification in the city of Rochester because they are expecting the advance and they will be taking street trees down. They're gonna, they're preparing and going out in advance of losing. I think this is probably an annual thing because if I recall, the newspaper clipping suggested there was lots of trees, lots of ash had been planted in Rochester.

?

As I recall it's like 500 trees, 500 or 600 trees

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Yeah. They want to start now removing ash trees.

Bruce Williamson (NYSDEC):

Yeah but if folks wanted to look at the APHIS Emerald Ash Borer.info on the web and look at community responses, this is what's happening all across the country where EAB is. Communities are starting. Even ones that aren't infested yet are becoming proactive. This is what we're encouraging communities to figure out what your ash resource is, what your exposure is, get involved with education, look at getting a plan together to try to address the ash resource that you have that could be at risk, start building into your plan now removal of some of your large ash,

your high risk ash so that you can manage that cost instead of ignoring it until you have 7000 dead ash trees hanging over your sidewalks and parks that you have to take down right away. That's killed some communities like Ann Arbor. Others, you know, they start building into their annual budget and their annual maintenance plan, how are we going to start addressing the ash, moving our urban forest canopy away from ash, replacing it as we can with other species. So, its all part of what we are trying to work on.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Yvonne, could you get the website real quick because Paul mentioned it on the conference call too. The website that's got all the information. Do you know it off the top of your head. I'm sorry, I don't mean to put you on the spot.

Yvonne DeMarino:

It's on my favorites.

?

Emerald Ash Borer.info

?

My question is if we did have other ideas on strategies for the control of that insect itself, that I'm concerned that communities don't have anything for any kind of tree management and you know that something that's been cut you know all along. DEC has been helpful in the past with tree planting programs and you know incentive programs but I'm just not sure what Rochester is doing with their 150,000 dollars. Just clear cutting ash trees, hopefully not.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

I can't give you the details.

---

---

2:00:08

Jackie Moody Czub (NYSDAM):

I just have a quick question, ---, but what counties in Pennsylvania are quarantined. Can you tell me what counties in Pennsylvania border New York, are any of them quarantined.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

None.

Jackie Moody Czub (NYSDAM):

Oh, None.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

That I know of.

Jackie Moody Czub (NYSDAM):

Not border

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

Not border counties.

Yvonne Demarino (USDA APHIS):  
There's Mifflin.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):  
Mifflin in the middle of the state.

Yvonne Demarino (USDA APHIS):  
In the middle of the state

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM)  
and then around Harrisburg area.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):  
They haven't got out to the north. Not to the right of the boundary. They are just below. There's a couple of counties between the boundary and the PA central western PA infestation.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):  
And that's --. Is Ames/True Temper here?

Kevin King (NYSDAM):  
Brian's next.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):  
Brian's next. He's got a big issue with that. I know he does.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):  
Brian go ahead. Tell us, tell us who you are with and how many mills and people are you...

Brian Williams (Ames/True Temper):  
Ash is our business, our sole business. On the timber side, we make shovels, hoes, wheelbarrows. We have a mill right where the Chautauqua/Cattaraugus quarantine is. Mifflin County and some other counties near Pittsburgh are quarantined below it and that mill is kind of in a zone all by itself. It used to be a two shift plant. It's a one shift plant today. So it really does impact us. That being said, we want to preserve the resource for as long as we can cause there is no other product that does what we need to do as effectively. So on one hand we -----on the other hand we have an interest in preserving this resource for as long as we possibly can because it will change the structure of this business. So I guess common sense regulations are the key. It looks like it made sense from a logistic standpoint to draw lines along the western side of the state. It's going to be very hard for folks----logs in those areas---. It's also a hardship not represented here is the landowners themselves. You've also isolated them from their market.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):  
Well actually we've got a couple of those and we'll get around to this side of the table. You'll hear from a couple of those in a minute. Now Brian you've got two manufacturing facilities that if we look at this from an east and west quarantine in the state, both your mills 100% ash, are right in between.

Brian Williams (Ames/True Temper):

Yes. I would love to find, not to wish something bad on anybody but I would love to find the bug in some other county.

---  
---

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Right. In Pine Valley and...

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

Unadilla.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

In Unadilla, you've got all these families associated with these ---

Brian Williams (Ames/True Temper):

Both of those facilities are nearly 20 people.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Thank you. Troy.

Troy Weldy (The Nature Conservancy):

One thing I want to point out on this map that it doesn't show is the infestations just outside of New York so we do have an infestation just north of the Clinton County border and in Quebec. We have an infestation just west of the Niagara border, Niagara County and then down the I-90 corridor of Maryland and Virginia. So I think that's important you know to have that --- discussion. Jerry, thanks for this. The Nature Conservancy also has we we've ---a study of two years ago looking at the movement of emerald ash borer across the entire northeast and through that modeling it was showing, actually it showed that it wouldn't reach Saugerties until 2017 but it actually had it sweeping across all of New York by 2020. You know Jerry mentioned about the Ruby... So based on that information I think you know what we are looking at is eventually EAB is going to sweep across the entire state. I am curious from a you know commerce standpoint this actually simplified it for the loggers, those that are using the forest resources, if there is actually a single statewide quarantine. Does that make it actually easier for everyone does it also save money on the state side. I actually, it's worth considering a statewide quarantine if that is indeed the case it makes it easier on the commerce side. If you're absolutely convinced that you've got to have an east west separation, I would jump you know one county east of those ones in western New York. So I would draw the line in Wayne, Seneca, Schuyler and Chemung. But first I would strongly push the statewide quarantine. And as part of that I also want to highlight the EPF does have an invasive species line--- Environmental Protection Fund does have invasive species, an invasive species line item in it and you know I think that the folks around this table actually may want to you know support that line item there and increase that line item and particularly I would I'd continue to ask for and push for actually using that funding to get troopers put at the Niagara maybe the, certainly the Plattsburg and then the Massena crossing on the Canadian border. I think that's appropriate use of the funds.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Troy, thank you. Good comments.

2:05:16

Eric Carlson, The Empire Forest Products:

Since I'm new in the, new at this whole issue and town, I think that you know we certainly have some numbers for Stephen on behalf of the economic impacts. As Troy brought up not only an interesting point but an important point as we look at this thing across the state. We want to make it as palatable on everyone as we can but at the same time, we certainly at the Association want to educate our members and help reach out to those folks that are impacted. Because it is impacting resource. We are concerned about that because that that's an economic value ---the forests. ---we want to make sure we give ourselves enough time. That this is going to take 5 or 10 years to spread slower than it gives some time for those who own forest land to extract some of that resource before they lose the value of it. I think that that's something that we've got to think about this, not just this year at this point in time but as we move forward with that. If its going to be an increasing envelope we ought to think about it now rather than waiting until next year to think full throttle. At the same time in listening to New York State with the firewood regulation, I think it's very interesting regulatory framework that provides I think an ideal opportunity to really have massive educational effort. Because to broader consumers, that's the key to let them help us understand and mitigate some of the impacts of this. We are certainly willing to, as an Association, not only reach out to our members but help the host, co-host some of the meeting--- have impact.—so that the people understand. Cause this is going to impact suppliers even coming into the state. People should be allowed, they should have something --. Even if we had a statewide quarantine, there's still a quarantine within New York and going out into the community to educate folks about what that ---as well.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

We're going to take you up on that I think and Mikes offer to organize a meeting for the industry in Ulster area with Jim's group too.

== =

02:07:26

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

The other thing you're going to do Eric when you go back to the office, you have an economic impact statement and that Mike and I did last year on this, send me a copy for the record so we can.

Eric Carlson (ESFPA):

We'll do that.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Thank you. Nicole.

2:07:37

Nicole Willis, New York Farm Bureau:

We represent almost 30,000 family farms and private landowners and timber operations. All a wide variety of industry. So for us the, our members do support controlling movement and essentially beyond that, you know, they want to know how to do that. How can they follow the regulations that are out there now. So from my perspective, a lot education, how do we follow the regs, to do this right, the proper way. They'd much rather be preemptive about it than try to figure it out later after there's more issues and more troubles that come up. So the sooner we know, the more education we do now. That's all I have to say.

2:08:26

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Thank you. Thank you. Tom.

Tom Gerow (Wagner Lumber):

Well, the nice thing about going towards the end is that everybody's said a lot of relevant things that I like. I like the Nature Conservancy's point of view. I think that's a very sensible, it's a big, big problem. A statewide problem. Whether we know or not it's obviously there. But, ash trees are a lot easier to deal with while they're living than once they're dead. Because it's very expensive once they're dead and very unsafe to deal with. So the more we deal with this upfront, I think the better. There are a lot of families, farms and woodlots where there's a significant economic impact. Facilitating, I think, access to markets as somebody mentioned, Brian, and I think that's very important. Having skips in the quarantine zone is, is gonna be very important and very problematic. And not to mention from an enforcement standpoint and a realistic standpoint, for people to follow it, it's gonna be very costly for everybody involved and probably not very effective at this point \_\_\_\_\_. Obviously jobs, there's a plant in Chemung county, a plant in Schuyler county, we've got 145 employees there, right on the edge of Steuben County, it's the next county over and coming from the eastern side, we have 3 plants, one in Tioga county and then one in I guess it's actually in Chenango county which we do a fair amount of business in Greene and Ulster county. So as this restriction going as everybody has said, it becomes very cumbersome and very expensive and it all comes back to the landowner in many cases and what is the value of their ash. Somebody mentioned earlier today, they had Marilyn or Margaret, about getting calls all the time, what do I do with my ash. Well right now there's a market for ash, you know, the manufacturing market, \_\_\_\_\_ and there's currently a worldwide market for ash. Where that's gonna be in 5 years nobody knows. There's resistance overseas about buying ash from quarantined zones, whether it's dry or now. APHIS is working on trying to appease the EU and how can we handle that. So, you know, in that case quarantining the whole state might be a negative, we don't know. So, the \_\_\_\_\_ but as far as a short term recommendation leaving Alleghany out I think would be a huge mistake and very costly and I would, with facilities in Chemung, Schuyler, Steuben, So if you quarantine Steuben county, my suggestion would be to include Schuyler, Chemung, and Alleghany and, you know, frankly at that point next year who knows where we're gonna be but the more you quarantine or the less you quarantine the better. Piecemeal is gonna be a real problem for everybody involved. I guess that's probably \_\_\_\_\_.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Mike.

2:11:48

Mike Birmingham (New York Forest Owners Association):

I represent private woodland owners, there's probably 500,000 in New York and 25 acres or more so a lot of the ash in this state is on those lands. And a lot of good comments. I think that communications on this pest have been very good. Many sources, Cornell, DEC, APHIS-PPQ and others. It strikes me that the one, the one thing that landowners are very much concerned with is what do they do and we have ash, do we move it quickly or do we sit on, sit it out and wait and before we take action. Do we relate to it differently within the quarantine areas than the nonquarantine. Is it a 3 to 5 year time horizon? Just what do we do? So, if that could be addressed and with some place we could channel people I'm thinking DEC or Ag and Markets, where you decide to go with it. That would be helpful to our organization to say look go to this website or this source to get that information on management. That's my primary comment.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Hard choices, hard choices.

Jerry Carlson (NYS DEC):

Mike are you saying that the current management information that's available at the Cornell site is inadequate or you would like to see more.

Mike Burmingham (NY Forest Owners):

No. actually I'm saying the opposite, I think it's good. I think there are...the speed of this of the development I think is one aspect that's alarming and maybe what we were saying months ago was you know, we have a little time, we're gonna watch and . But I think with the events unfolding as fast as they are and the prospects of the quarantine changing, I think it raises the..in the minds of landowner, what do we need to do to respond to these changing conditions. So if the websites pick up on this then you could address what I'm concerned with but if they don't then I think it's gonna raise some issues.

2:14:18

?:

Mark Mark Witmore is taking the immediate action message out to the to the landowners now.

?:

I didn't hear what the.

?:

Mark Witmore of Cornell is taking the immediate action message out around the state and he's \_\_\_\_\_ website is being updated with the emergencies. So it seems to me, from DEC's perspective that we continue to work with Cornell and help them deliver that message as opposed to doing something extra.

Ethan Angell (NYSDAM):

Well I think the other important point there is to work with APHIS because a lot of Mark's funding for that outreach is funded through Yvonne and John. So, you know, in terms of working with Cornell, they can only do so much if they have the funding. So really you've gotta go back to Yvonne and say you know we we think we have a good relationship with Cornell, its working well. If that funding stream continues, this is a good thing.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Helen, Im \_\_\_everybodys indulgence. We are we are going, over, I'm sorry but I really think this is important. I want to get through all this. Helen.

Helen Thomas (NYS Maple Producers):

I'm here with Eric Randall. I'm going to let Eric address the regulation question. I just want to emphasize that we are very strongly in favor of education and any outreach we can do both to our members we have a strong consumer base that we contact in the sale of our products. We'd like to improve our ability to reach out and educate those\_\_\_\_\_.

Eric Randall (New York State Maple Producers):

We're looking, and we're gonna be selfish here, we're looking at EAB as the primer for ALB. It scares the bejesus out of us quite frankly. We're gonna lose more than our ash with ALB

quite frankly. All puns intended. But I think that its important that that and I agree with Helen and I agree with all the other colleagues around the table that education is probably the single most important thing that we can do at this point in time. I think if you couple and im not so worried about the international borders as I am the domestic borders. People from somebody said New Jersey bringing wood, a cord of wood into their campground and whatever. But if we put the signs, again going back to Michigan that don't transport firewood at every portal in the state and and you combine that kind of education with, I would take it even to Ag in the classroom and get every kid to start looking, that's what they did in Worcester on the ALB is they trained boyscouts, girlscouts, kids to go out and look for gallery holes and that's how they found, you know, the 10 mile radius around Worcester. Is is is go to hunting clubs and sportsman clubs and people that are in in the wood lots and on the streets to determine and call in to the 800 number. If you tandem quarantine, quarantine with portal education and other kinds of education, you'll get landowners and mill owners to to comply with this. I have some real concern with the 50 mile radius. If you look at the corner of the black on your map in Cattaraugus county, little village of Yorkshire, 50 miles from Yorkshire in Cattaraugus County takes in all of Wyoming two-thirds of Erie County. What's 50 miles mean? Is it 50 miles from the county seat? Is it 50 miles from the yellow trap where we found an Emerald Ash Borer. What does...50 miles doesn't mean anything. I agree with the people that are saying nuke Alleghany County and put it in. Don't quote me...I'm already on tape.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

You're on tape. We can edit it for you.

Eric Randall (NYS Maple Producers):

The only reason Allegany county isn't there is because nobody's been to the county. If I were to do the quarantine and I'm not sure how the efficacy of the quarantine would be I would agree with whoever said to go Wayne county and down and south of the thruway. I do signs, I would do education at domestic borders. I would also determine and look at the maps and I'm sure that the people at Cornell and ESF and others have done some overlays of the geographic differences in New York State. The lake plains verses the uplands and laying over the dendrology, the distribution of largely white ash. There is some blue and green, there is no pumpkin ash in New York State. There are four species. You can follow those and then look and determine there where you've got your traps or where you need your traps. Education is the big thing and vector analysis.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Thank you. John.

2:19:11

John Sheenan (Adirondack Council):

I very much agree with the public education effort that people are espousing here both by the state and by everybody in the room. That we can educate our customers, our members and anybody we are coming into contact professionally with that this is something that needs to be thought about and incorporate it into our plans for management in the future. To that end, on public property I think that we need to consider having the Department of Environmental Conservation and Parks Department taking a look at its management plans for public lands and consider the option of, where appropriate, of closing roadways that go through the forest preserve that are not roads need for people to get to their homes or commerce but there may be some places where we can restrict access by motor vehicles that seems to be the key vector in every one of the infestations that I've seen, seems to be within a quarter mile or tenth of a mile of a public

roadway. We do have some wilderness in the Adirondacks where that would not be a problem and I'd like to make sure that those areas remain unaffected by the infestation if possible. But as it sweeps from west to east across the state we may find that there are some places that are more resistant than others. I suspect that roadways are going to be key in identifying those. Public campground management plans are also something and conservation easement plans and timber company owners in the park all ought to take into consideration the best ways to try and control the new migration of these pests into places where they don't exist now. And given the stakes here both in terms of public resources and private resources a lot of timber companies still in the park, a lot of timber operations in the park that this would serve everybody very well to try and keep this one spot where we haven't yet found anything in that same condition in the future. And we'd be very much in favor of using environmental infection fund invasive species funding not only for setting up border crossing but maybe for a portable facility of some kind, whether it's a container or \_\_\_ or something that can be used for occasional spot checks around the Adirondack and Catskill parks to help protect forests. Thank you.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

John, In terms of quarantine area, everything but the Adirondacks kind of approach, is that what I heard you say. I'm just trying to, not to put words in your mouth.

John Sheenan (Adirondack Council):

I'm not sure what to advise you on the quarantine area because movement is something that you've got over 100 sawmills in the Adirondacks still that mostly do business locally but we've still got a lot of logs leaving the park with the bark still on them. And I'm not sure how to advise you on that. I'd love to see them all covered but I don't know that that's practical.

Marylyn Wyman (NY Forest Owners Association and Cornell Cooperative Extension):

I think we really from both those organizations we are in an education and outreach mode. I know Mike had mentioned the 500,000 private forest landowners that are represented in New York State with 25 acres or more, unfortunately we really only interface directly through our publications we've been trying to do education about these pests for a number of years. But we only have, you know, a fraction of that. So I think one of the big issues that we have to deal with is really trying to target the nonindustrial private forest landowner. It's a very challenging group to be able to work with. But I know the recommendations from Cornell Cooperative Extension and working with Pete and also through \_\_\_\_\_ because we've been partners with them for a number of years is we've been telling the landowners, you work with the forester. We're always encouraging them to work with a professional forester and talk to them about the recommendations that foresters would make, do you harvest them now. You know, this is a good opportunity to recoup some of your value. If you wait, what's the impact, financial impact. So I think it's really important that we make sure that we update our constituents with regards to regulations, try to expand our influence beyond that and really work with, I know, you know, we do a lot with forest connect. Those limited extension agencies and associations that have natural resource responsibilities, we're trying to magnify our impact in whatever region around we happen to work with so, you know, give us, help us understand. I also know that Mike and I were sent here to represent our organization. I don't know how the rest of the board of directors are going to feel. So, you know, we have to go back and say heres sort of what we've learned, try to canvass them. We have people who might create a different strategy for our western areas and verses our eastern areas and what we do in-between. But, you know, really trying to communicate. Keep us updated. We have websites, full variety of avenues to do that so just communication is going to be really key in us working collaboratively.

2:24:21

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

And that's important. Marilyn, to the point of, also going backward folks, we'll be doing this over the next couple of weeks so as you, just encouraging everybody, you know, if you talk with additional members of the board and somebody has a different thought in terms of quarantine approach, please feel free to let us know. I mean that, that's, yes, that's what we're asking you to do so than you.

Marylyn Wyman (NY Forest Owners Association and Cornell Cooperative Extension):

And I also know im working with other extension agents to put together some kind of management work plan because municipal officials are looking at us for well what could we do and how can you help us facilitate community workplans how do you anticipate costs and you know. Everybody knows theres no money out there and they're like oh my god where am I going to find the money to address this issue. But we haven't included regulations in there because it was a big unknown so we have to make sure that whatever we get out to those municipal officials to help them facilitate how they are going to be responding to this really gonna be also very important. Cause they have their own perspective once they go back and you talk to the people that you represent.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

Alan

2:25:26

Alan White (The Catskill Center for Conservation and Development):

I think we've had a good conversation today. Some of the things that came out are gonna lead me towards being probably extreme. I think we have an extreme amount of uncertainty in terms of what we know and don't know. We're not confident in our delineation. Detection of this insect is proving to be exceptionally difficult. We don't even know it's there until its really there. Jerry Carlson talks about how fast it spreads and moves. We've heard about the limited resources both at the state and federal government level. We've got some preserve issues. So, when I add that all up strictly from a business standpoint and think it through, I'm not sure the discussion of a spot quarantine is anything more than destruction to our industries. I hate to be pessimistic but I think the horse is out of the barn on this one. And I'd really rather see New York State do as little as possible on this insect and save our resources for some things that may be more of long term solutions like the biocontrols. I'd like to see some recognition that in the Catskills where ash is 5-10% of our of our forest composition and maple is and the things that are affected by ALB are 60-70% of our forest composition. I'm kind of thinking that we might want to keep our power dry and plan for the bigger threats coming down the road. Very supportive of the idea of pursuing the biocontrols because I think that's a long term solution rather than a short term solution and when we get into the issue of education it's a big one. We've talked in the Catskills about having an education program called eyes on ash and the first conclusion that we come to is in the Catskills there's probably only 5-10% of the population knows what an ash tree looks like. So, we've got a lot of work to do.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

I guess in kind of summing all this up, very helpful and really good comments towards I think a really good discussion. We will certainly keep in touch with you in terms if we have all your contact information and let you know how we progress. We will be moving into a rule making process in the next couple of weeks. I encourage you to share the information you've learned with your constituency. We did ask you all to come here kind of representing various

groups and we need your help in getting the word out. That's an important role for you folks to be playing. You know, unfortunately we probably are having this conversation next year to some extent but I'm a little surprised, you know, just a personal observation. I didn't expect the conversation to kind go, I'm hearing a fairly strong consensus about a larger portion of the state rather than a smaller portion almost to the point that you guys gave us a pretty good direction on some lines that could be drawn that would accommodate a significant portion of the interests around this table which is not going to make everybody happy but certainly moves us, you know, gets us, more people included and more involved in the decision making than not so I really appreciate the thoughts and comments. Dave.

Dave:

Kevin, it would be probably helpful to have a PDF that you can provide and also if these maps were a PDF.

Kevin King (NYSDAM):

We can get you some updates of the materials and the information for you to share beyond that. And again, if you have thoughts between now and the ride home as you're talking to other people, this is timely now, don't have an ah-ha moment a month from now because by that time we'll have some stuff in writing so anything you've got right now, we'd really appreciate that kind of feedback and you can funnel it through me and I'll share it back as we go forward. Thank you again. I apologize for going over into the lunch hour but thank you.